

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION REQUEST: Timeline: FSA communication with FSAI

DOC no	Date	Time	Detail	Note
1a & 1b	23/11/2012		Food Standards Agency, Northern Ireland office (FSANI) senior management team met with FSAI	1(a) Draft FSAI-FSA minute (<i>normally agreed at follow up meeting</i>) 1(b) FSA external meeting note (<i>standard internal record</i>)
2	10/01/13		Andrew Wadge, FSA Chief Scientist, spoke to Prof Alan Reilly (FSAI), as part of their regular contact.	AW emailed note
3	14/01/13	10.30	Prof Alan Reilly telephone call to Gerry McCurdy, Director FSA Northern Ireland.	GM emailed note
4	14/01/03	Mid pm	Call from Prof Alan Reilly (FSAI) to Andrew Wadge (FSA)	Emailed note of conversation – relayed by FSA Head of Incidents
(3)	14/01/13	Mid pm	Prof Alan Reilly (FSAI) telephone call to Gerry McCurdy (FSA)	GM emailed note of conversation.
4	14/01/13	16:15	Call from Andrew Wadge (FSA Chief Scientist) to FSA Incidents Unit re: telephone conversation with FSAI	Email summary of AW and AR conversation
5	15/01/13	14.02	E-mail from FSA in Northern Ireland to Rapid Alert (FSAI)	Email
6(i)	15/01/13	15.10	E-mail from Rapid Alert to FSA in NI	Email
6(ii)	15/01/13	16.39	E-mail form FSA in NI to Rapid Alert (FSAI)	Email
6(iii)	15/01/13	16.54	E-mail Rapid Alert (FSAI) to FSA in NI	Email
6(iv)	16/01/13	10:44	E-mail from FSA in NI to Rapid Alert (FSAI)	Email
6(v)	16/01/13	10:53	E-mail from Rapid Alert to FSA in NI	Email
7(i)	17/01/13	10.58	E-mail from FSA in NI to Rapid Alert (FSA)	Email
7(ii)	17/01/13	11.12	E-mail from Rapid Alert (FSAI) to FSA in NI	Email
7(iii)	17/01/13	11.18	E-mail from FSA in NI to Rapid Alert (FSAI)	Email
n/a	17/01/13	11:30	Call to FSAI from FSA in NI in relation to obtaining information on methodologies and thresholds. Return call from FSAI to FSA in NI with some information on levels of porcine DNA in product at approx 11:40	Call logged
n/a	17/01/13	15:00	Call to FSAI from FSA in NI in relation to requesting information on following up traceability of products - followed up by e-mail confirmation at 15:20	Call logged
8	17/01/13	15.20	E-mail from FSA in NI to FSAI - Confirmation of earlier telephone call	Email
9	17/01/13	16.51	Email from FSAI to FSA incidents	Email
n/a	17/01/13	20:14	Call from FSAI to FSA in NI - Request for information following up traceability of products	Call logged

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION REQUEST

1a: Extract from draft minutes of meeting between Food Safety Authority Ireland (FSAI) and FSA Northern Ireland (FSANI) within scope of FOI request

NB – This is a draft minute, produced by FSA Northern Ireland. The minutes have not yet been agreed and will be discussed at the next meeting between FSANI and FSAI.

Meeting between FSAI and FSA in NI 23-11-12

Present :

FSA attendees:

Gerry McCurdy (GMcC)
Maria Jennings (MJ)
Michael Jackson (MJack)
Roberta Ferson (RF)

FSAI attendees:

Raymond Ellard (RE)
Wayne Anderson (WA)
Bernard Hegarty (BH)

Item 1: Apologies:

Peter Whelan
Alan Reilly

Item 6: trade in horsemeat

FSAI developing a methodology for testing for horse DNA. This was at an early stage of development and would keep FSA in NI advised. FSA in NI agreed a possible joint sampling initiative at some time in the future should the methodology prove robust.

1b: Extract from Food Standards Agency external meetings feedback note
(Note made available internally within the FSA, following meetings with external stakeholders) of meeting held between Food Safety Authority Ireland and FSA Northern Ireland

EVENT/MEETING: Senior Management Teams of FSA in NI and FSAI

Date: 23 November 2012

Location: FSA in NI Offices

External Attendees: Ray Ellard, Wayne Anderson, Bernard Hegarty

Internal attendees: Gerry McCurdy, Maria Jennings, Michael Jackson

- Possible joint sampling initiative re detection of undeclared horse meat in products and FSAI to forward action list arising from meeting with owners of horse meat plants.

[out of scope]

From: Wadge, Andrew
Sent: Monday, January 28, 2013 09:42 AM
To: Brown, Catherine; McNulty, Liz
Cc: Wearne, Steve; Mccurdy, Gerry; Houston, Colin; Gleadle, Alison
Subject: Re: Contact Log - TESCO and FSANI

Phone call details:

Alan reilly and I spoke on thurs 10 jan - we are in regular contact and on this occasion I recall we were discussing Heads of Agencies meetings. In passing, Alan mentioned they were doing some authenticity checks on meat products. He agreed to share results with me as soon as he had them confirmed.

This he did by way of a phone call on monday 14 jan at about 4pm. I relayed the details of this call immediately to Colin Houston.

Andrew

[Out of scope]

From: Mccurdy, Gerry
Sent: 29 January 2013 13:57
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Contact Log - TESCO and FSANI

[section 40]

[REDACTED]

Alan Reilly rang me around 10.30am on 14th January 2013 to give me a heads up on an investigation FSAI were conducting into meat products produced by two companies in the RoI which indicated the presence of equine and porcine DNA. He named the two plants, Silvercrest and Liffeymeats. He indicated that one of the samples from Silvercrest had up to 29% equine DNA in a frozen burger. Other samples had traces of equine and porcine DNA. He also advised that a plant in the UK HN012 [Dalepak] had also traces of equine and porcine DNA and that some major retailers, Tesco and Iceland were implicated. He further advised that this was considered a food authenticity issue and not a food safety one.

Alan advised that he was on his way to a meeting with DAFM to discuss issue, this was early stage of investigation, he was sharing information in confidence at this stage, this was a heads up and would speak to me after meeting with DAFM.

Later in the afternoon [3.30sh] Alan rang me back to say he had spoken to A.Wadge earlier and advised him of situation. Alan advised that FSAI was intending to meet with industry the following day. I advised Alan that I would now inform FSA London. I also asked if FSAI intended any communications / media. Alan advised not at this stage and said he would give me a heads up on this. Alan asked that this information was confined to FSA. I then spoke to Alison Gleadle and advised her of situation[4.15sh] Alison advised me that Colin Houston was looking for her urgently and assumed Andrew Wadge had spoken to Colin.

I had no advance notice of media interest or FSAI press release.

I think A. Wadge's note of discussion with Alan Reilly may have more detail re results.

[REDACTED]

[out of scope]

Hope this is helpful

Gerry

Gerry McCurdy
Director in Northern Ireland
Food Standards Agency
10a Clarendon Road

[out of scope]

From: Houston, Colin
Sent: Monday, January 14, 2013 04:23 PM
To: Gleadle, Alison; Humphreys, Stephen; Mccurdy, Gerry; Wadge, Andrew; Wearne, Steve; Rhodes, Andrew; Milne, Charles
Cc: McNulty, Liz; Boyd, susanne; Jackson, Michael; Redmond, Liz; Ogle, Geoff; Everard, Justin; Patel, Sital; Appleby, Sarah; MacDonald, Elspeth; [REDACTED] [Section 40]
Subject: Notification of Horse meat in burgers from RoI

All,

Andrew Wadge called to advise that he had been contacted by Andrew Riley in RoI.

RoI have been undertaking DNA testing on beef burgers and the following has been identified in certain samples.

29% Horse meat has been found in beef burgers produced in RoI plant IE565EC. This producer supplies to Tesco.

Traces of pig meat has been found in beef burgers produced in RoI plant IE325EC. Distribution not know at this stage.

In addition traces of pig/horse meat has been found in beef burgers produced by a UK plant HN012EC. These were Iceland quarter pounders.

It is understood that RoI will be issuing a RASFF and will go public.

ACTIONS

1. Comms to develop lines based on available information.
2. NI to contact RoI to obtain information about the supplier of the meat to the production plants to ascertain where the raw material originated from.

3. Once we have additional information about the UK plant (clarification of the level of cross contamination or adulteration) the LA for the plant will be contacted to ascertain where the raw material originated from.

Regards

Colin Houston
Head of Incidents Unit
Food Safety Group
Food Standards Agency
125 Kingsway
London WC2B 6NH
Tel: 0207 [REDACTED]
Fax: 0207 [REDACTED]

[section 40]

Save paper don't print unless necessary

From: [REDACTED] [Section 40]
Sent: 15 January 2013 14:02
To: Rapid Alert
Cc: Jackson, Michael; [REDACTED] Boyd, susanne; Ross, Jim
Subject: Request for info on horse meat in burgers

Good Afternoon [REDACTED]

With regards to discussions between FSA in NI and FSAI at CEO level yesterday evening on the above subject, we requested information about the supplier of the meat to the production plants to ascertain where the raw material originated from. Is this information available yet?

Also, is there any way to ascertain the level of cross contamination/adulteration in the product supplied to UK plant HN012EC and how has this issue been communicated to retailers whose products are implicated in this incident?

Thanks and Kind Regards,

[REDACTED]

[Section 40]

[REDACTED]

Food Incidents, Standards and Science
Food Standards Agency in Northern Ireland

[REDACTED]

food.gov.uk
food.gov.uk/ratings
nidirect.gov.uk/eatwell

From: incidents.ni
Sent: 16 January 2013 10:56
To: Rapid Alert
Subject: RE: Meat authenticity in Frozen Beef Burgers

Many thanks [redacted]
Regards,

[redacted]
[redacted]

Food Incidents, Standards and Science
Food Standards Agency in Northern Ireland

[redacted]
food.gov.uk
food.gov.uk/ratings
nidirect.gov.uk/eatwell

[Section 40]

-----Original Message-----

From: Rapid Alert [mailto:[redacted]]
Sent: 16 January 2013 10:53
To: incidents.ni; FoodIncidents
Cc: [redacted], Boyd, susanne; Jennings, Maria; Rapid Alert; McNulty, Liz
Subject: RE: Meat authenticity in Frozen Beef Burgers

(b)(v)

Hi [redacted]

Yes Lidl confirmed that the withdrawn burger products were also distributed to NI and GB Lidl stores. The Lidl withdrawal notices were sent yesterday afternoon to the NI and GB stores by the Lidl offices in ROI.

The Tesco products were withdrawn from all stores yesterday in ROI, NI and GB. Apologies for not getting back to you sooner on this.

Regards,
[redacted]

[Section 40]

-----Original Message-----

From: incidents.ni [mailto:incidents.ni@foodstandards.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 16 January 2013 10:44
To: Rapid Alert
Cc: [redacted], Boyd, susanne; Jennings, Maria
Subject: RE: Meat authenticity in Frozen Beef Burgers

(div)

Morning [redacted]

[Section 40]

Did you receive confirmation on the Lidl distribution and points below?

Kind regards,

[Section 40]
[Redacted]
Food Incidents, Standards and Science
Food Standards Agency in Northern Ireland

[Redacted]
food.gov.uk
food.gov.uk/ratings
nidirect.gov.uk/eatwell

-----Original Message-----

From: Rapid Alert [mailto:[Redacted]]
Sent: 15 January 2013 16:54
To: Jackson, Michael
Cc: incidents.ni; [Redacted] McNulty, Liz; Rapid Alert; FoodIncidents
Subject: RE: Meat authenticity in Frozen Beef Burgers

[Section 40]

6(ii)

Hi Michael,

Dunnes Stores have confirmed to us that 2 product lines, which were withdrawn in ROI stores, also went to NI stores. These 2 product lines were withdrawn by their NI stores this afternoon as well.

Tesco are still confirming this but they do expect that the withdrawn product lines went to GB and NI stores as well. It may be tomorrow morning before we get this confirmed.

We are awaiting confirmation of any distribution by Lidl to NI and GB stores. Once we have this, we will of course, let you know.

Regards,

[Redacted]
[Section 40]

-----Original Message-----

From: Jackson, Michael [mailto:[Redacted]]
Sent: 15 January 2013 16:39
To: Rapid Alert
Cc: incidents.ni; [Redacted] McNulty, Liz
Subject: FW: Meat authenticity in Frozen Beef Burgers
Importance: High

6(ii)

[Section
40]

Hi [REDACTED]

Many thanks for the update on the action regarding adulterated samples.

With regard to the recall by Tesco Ireland, Dunnes, and the likely action by Lidl, I would appreciate if you could confirm that supply of the affected batches was confined to the retail outlets of these companies in Republic of Ireland and there was no supply to NI or other parts of the UK.

My colleagues in London will be following up on the results relating to HN012EC.

Regards

Michael

Michael Jackson
Head of Food Safety and Operations
Food Standards Agency in Northern Ireland

Tel. No [REDACTED]

www.food.gov.uk
www.eatwell.gov.uk
www.food.gov.uk/ratings

-----Original Message-----

From: Rapid Alert [mailto:[REDACTED]]
Sent: 15 January 2013 15:10
To: FoodIncidents; McNulty, Liz; incidents.ni
Cc: Rapid Alert; Ellard, Ray
Subject: Meat authenticity in Frozen Beef Burgers
Importance: High

6(i)

[Section
40]

Dear FSA,
FSAI conducted a survey of frozen beef burgers to see if there was any equine or porcine DNA present. Samples were taken at Irish retailers in Nov 2012. We recently received quantification of equine DNA, if present. Ten of 27 samples were found to contain equine DNA. All but one were <1% equine DNA, many were just trace. One contained 29% equine DNA and was purchased in Tesco's. Today we have informed the Irish retailers concerned (includes Tesco Ireland, Lidl Ireland and Aldi Ireland), but we also have a positive result for Iceland burgers and, despite attempts, have not yet made contact with Iceland Ireland manager.
Here are all the results for Iceland which has a UK manufacturing plant:

[see
attachment
(attachment)]

Tesco Ireland (and Dunnes Stores) have already withdrawn from sale all their frozen beef burgers from the 2 Irish plants that are implicated. Aldi and Lidl will probably undertake the same action shortly. We would expect that you would want to carry out checks at the UK plant that makes the Iceland burgers. We will not issue any RASFFs as there is no food safety concerns, but we expect that there will be media attention and we might issue a press release today or tomorrow.

Inspectors are investigating the contamination in both Irish production plants, as of yet, there does not seem to be a common source of beef, or other ingredients, but investigations continue.

Kind regards,

[REDACTED]

=====

[REDACTED]

Technical Executive - Food Incidents & Rapid Alerts

Email: [REDACTED] (to all rapid alert team, checked every working day)

Tel: [REDACTED]

Tel: [REDACTED]

Tel: [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Tel: [REDACTED]

Tel: [REDACTED]

Tel: [REDACTED]

Fax: [REDACTED]

Food Safety Authority of Ireland
Abbey Court
Lower Abbey Street
Dublin 1
Ireland

Website: www.fsai.ie Find us on Facebook:
www.facebook.com/FSAI

[AU
Section
40]

Attachment to 6(i)

Sample Number	Product Name	Retailer	Manufacturer Name	Burger Results			Plant Number	Beef Content	Ingredients in order of Listings	Porcine DNA	Equine DNA
				Batch Code	BBD						
FSAI B04	Iceland Beef Burgers	Iceland	n/a	2269A 2147	26-Sep-13	UK HN 012 EC	79%	Water, onion 6%, rusk, seasoning	Negative	Negative	
FSAI B28	Iceland Quarter Ponders	Iceland	n/a	2250 A 15:27	07/09/2013	UK HN012 EC	98%	Seasoning	Positive	Positive 0.1%	
FSAI B29	Iceland Quarter Ponders	Iceland	n/a	2218 A 15:55	06/08/2013	UK HN012 EC	79%	Water, onion 6%, rusk, seasoning	Positive	Positive 0.1%	

[All: section 40]

7

From: incidents.ni
Sent: 17 January 2013 11:18
To: Rapid Alert
Cc: Boyd, susanne; [REDACTED] Jennings, Maria; Ellard, Ray; Reilly, Alan
Subject: RE: Horsemeat Incident - Request for Supplier&COO Information

[REDACTED]

Can you give us any indication of the timescale for when this information will be made available?

It would aid the investigation in the UK, allowing cross-reference against suppliers to the implicated plant in the UK.

Regards,

[REDACTED]
Food Incidents, Standards and Science
Food Standards Agency in Northern Ireland

[REDACTED]
food.gov.uk
food.gov.uk/ratings
nidirect.gov.uk/eatwell

From: Rapid Alert [mailto:[REDACTED]]
Sent: 17 January 2013 11:12
To: incidents.ni
Cc: Boyd, susanne; [REDACTED] Jennings, Maria; Rapid Alert; Ellard, Ray; Reilly, Alan
Subject: RE: Horsemeat Incident - Request for Supplier&COO Information

Hi [REDACTED]

We don't have the information to answer your queries below.

Department of Agriculture Veterinary Inspectors are in both plants and have been conducting the investigations into this incident which are ongoing.

Regards,
[REDACTED]

From: incidents.ni [mailto:incidents.ni@foodstandards.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 17 January 2013 10:58
To: Rapid Alert

[All: section 40]

Cc: Boyd, susanne, [REDACTED], Jennings, Maria
Subject: Horsemeat Incident - Request for Supplier&COO Information
Importance: High

[REDACTED]
Good morning,

Can you please provide us with the following information?

1. Who supplies meat to Liffey Foods and Silvercrest?
2. Where does this meat originate from (COO) etc.?
3. Do the suppliers also supply meat to other processors (other than Liffey & Silvercrest)?

Many thanks,

[REDACTED]
Food Incidents, Standards and Science
Food Standards Agency in Northern Ireland

[REDACTED]
food.gov.uk
food.gov.uk/ratings
nidirect.gov.uk/eatwell

Food Standards Agency (FSA)

For the latest food news and information visit www.food.gov.uk

This email and any attachments are intended for the named recipient only. Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage or copying is not permitted. If you have received this email in error, please destroy all copies and inform the sender immediately by return email.

The original of this email was scanned for viruses by the Government Secure Intranet (GSI) virus scanning service supplied exclusively by Cable & Wireless Worldwide in partnership with MessageLabs and on leaving the GSI this email was certified virus-free. However you should always use your own virus-scanning software to ensure mail and attachments are safe to open.

[out of scope]

From: Boyd, susanne
Sent: 17 January 2013 15:20
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: Mccurdy, Gerry; Jennings, Maria; Houston, Colin; McNulty, Liz; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] incidents.ni; Rapid Alert
Subject: FW: Dalepak Samples - Iceland
Importance: High

section 40

Ray

As discussed on telephone – please see below. This information is in relation to suppliers to Dalepak which may be useful for cross reference in relation to the two premises in Rol.

I would be grateful if you could provide a response as soon as possible. Please be aware that this issue was raised at Prime Minister's Questions yesterday and the Prime Minister directed the FSA to undertake a full investigation. An updated report is expected by Ministers tomorrow.

- Who supplies meat to Liffey Foods and Silvercrest.
- Where does this meat originate from (Country of Origin?)
- Do Silvercrest and Liffey supply other customers and if so whom?

Many thanks in anticipation

Kind regards

Susanne

Sources of meat from Dalepak

Section 31(1)(g) and (2)(a) and (c)

INFORMATION REDACTED UNDER FOI ACT SECTION 31(1) (g) and (2) (a) and (c)

INFORMATION REDACTED UNDER FOI ACT SECTION 31(1) (g) and (2) (a) and (c)

[out. of scope]

From: Ellard, Ray [mailto: [REDACTED]]
Sent: Thursday, January 17, 2013 04:51 PM
To: McNulty, Liz
Cc: Rapid Alert [REDACTED]
Subject: FSA Investigation

[section 40]

[section 40]

Hi Liz,

We saw the FSA notice yesterday about a planned 4 point investigation into beef products contained equine and porcine DNA. Two of the points refer to FSAI

- 2. To explore further, in conjunction with the Food Safety Authority of Ireland, the methodology used for the survey to understand more clearly the factors that may have led to the low level cases of cross-contamination.
- 3. To consider, with relevant local authorities and the Food Safety Authority of Ireland, whether any legal action is appropriate following the investigation.

Can you tell us who is leading on the investigation and who will be in touch?

Thanks

Ray

Food Safety Authority of Ireland

The information contained in this email and in any attachments is confidential and is designated solely for the attention and use of the intended recipient(s).

This information may be subject to legal and professional privilege.

If you are not an intended recipient of this email, you must not use, disclose, copy, distribute or retain this message or any part of it.

If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete all copies of this email from your computer system(s).

Údarás Sábháilteachta Bia na hÉireann